

THE PRODUCTION OF A CONTEMPORARY FAMINE IMAGE: THE IMAGE ECONOMY, INDIGENOUS PHOTOGRAPHERS AND THE CASE OF MEKANIC PHILIPPOS

A much shorter version of this paper was published in the *Journal of International Development*, *J. Int. Dev.* 16, 1–12 (2004). Published online in Wiley InterScience (www.interscience.wiley.com).

D. J. CLARK

Introduction

At the end of 2001 VSO published *The Live Aid Legacy*, a research report that demonstrated the majority of UK consumers still retained a “one-dimensional view of developing countries...primarily driven by images of drought and famine” (VSO, 2001). Although the title suggests these views are the inheritance of the Ethiopian famine of 1984 and the Live Aid event that followed, the record of photographic representations of the majority world over the past century shows a sustained bombardment of such images that has continued up to the present day (Harrison & Palmer, 1986).¹ In this paper I focus on the relationship between the trade of images of the majority world in the international image economy and the photographers that create them and investigate issues that arise.

The paper is divided into four sections. In the first section I provide a background of the current international image economy and its connection to the majority world. I discuss the gradual globalisation of the market and the effects this has on photographers and the images they produce. In section two I evaluate the reasons behind a recent growth of indigenous photographers in the majority world. I use case studies in Bangladesh and Ethiopia to argue that growth of indigenous photography is occurring in the majority world but with no prescribed formula. In section three I analyse issues of context, power, and style and make the case that the growth of indigenous photographers selling images into the international image market is being driven by economic rather than ethical forces. Using arguments from the first three sections, section four analyses a single photograph published in the UK press at the end of May 2003 of Bob Geldof’s visit to Ethiopia. Five photographers, two British, travelling from the UK, one Canadian recently sent to work from Nairobi, a Kenyan and an Ethiopian, covered the visit. I deconstruct the images they produced in relation to historical Ethiopian famine iconography and the influence of the globalised international image economy and conclude in this case that the photographer’s nationality and/or familiarity with the country has no influence on the images produced.

1./ The International Image Economy and Its Relationship to the Majority World

The total global image market is estimated to be worth US\$6.5 Billion, but due to its fractured nature no one really knows the exact figure. Sixty percent of the market is in direct commissions to photographers and the rest in sale of “off the shelf”² images (Rubython, 2002 & Cane, 2002). During the past ten years the market has been revolutionised by new technologies, Linda Royles, managing director of the British Association of Picture Libraries and Agencies comments “There is a phenomenal change going on in the market at the moment. I really think people will look back at this period in the same way people now look at the changes from agricultural to industrial.”³

In this section I will describe the market in the early 1990's and compare it to that of the current market highlighting the changes that have taken place. I will also discuss the implications to photographers and the market in which they operate.

The Early 90's

In this paper I refer only to pictures that are freely available to any publication world wide to buy. This excludes all directly commissioned photographs that are shot solely for a single use. In the early 1990's this market could generally be divided into three sections,

The News Wire Services: Named after the wire along which Morse code news was originally sent. The wire services first introduced pictures in 1927 but were not sent electronically until 1935.⁴ There are three dominant international news wire agencies. Reuters, established in 1851 and based in London, which currently has 198 bureaux serving 150 countries and also provides financial information and technology solutions.⁵ Associated Press (AP), established in 1848 has 242 bureaux worldwide and serves a predominantly US market⁶ and Agencé France-Pressé (AFP), established in 1835 and based in Paris, AFP has 117 bureaux worldwide serving 165 countries.⁷ At this period photographers working for wire services would scan images at the local bureaux and send them to the main office from where they were distributed electronically to publications subscribing to the service. Each image would take around 40 minutes to send and therefore normally only one image would be sent per story. Images were used primarily by newspapers and weekly news magazines⁸

Wire services had been using local photographers since the early 80's and were providing basic training.⁹ However, they were normally employed as stringers (non contract photographers) and only in places where local bureaux existed.¹⁰

Feature News Picture Agencies: These were staffed predominantly by freelance photographers, who followed world news and submitted picture stories to agencies that sold the images on commission to weekly/monthly current affairs magazines. Photographers would shoot for the most part colour slide film and courier the processed slides to the main office. Agencies such as Sigma, Magnum, Network and Black Star are good examples.

Stock Picture Libraries: Commissioned freelance and travelling photographers would often also shoot stock images to be sold on a 50% commission basis by a photographic library that stored their slides and prints in filing cabinets. The libraries

were extremely labour intensive as picture researchers would trawl through thousands of images until they found a selection meeting the clients needs. They would then send those images by post to the client in the hope there was a sale. The process would start again when the images were returned.¹¹

In 1994 Peter Fenton, in association with the Drik Picture library in Bangladesh, conducted a survey of indigenous photographers working in the majority world. His findings demonstrated that competent photographers did exist in the bulk of the countries surveyed but few were selling their images internationally. "Due to power structures that exist in the world today, the large majority of images of the South that we see, are taken and produced by photographers from the North." (Fenton, 1995)

Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, London, recalls the flow of photography came from Europe and the USA. Photographers were commissioned by a mixture of publications and NGO's to travel to countries normally to complete a number of assignments and then return.¹²

New Technologies, Gates and Getty

With the emergence of cheap film scanners in the mid 90's and then digital photography in the late 90's the wire agencies have changed their way of working. Photographers carry laptop computers and send images from the field removing the need to return to the bureaux to file. This has led to a massive expansion of indigenous photographers used, but not contracted, in the majority world by the wire agencies.

Indian photographer Pablo Bartholomew argues that the most talented local photographers have gone to work for the wires because they offer an opportunity for international exposure and reasonable financial rewards¹³. However they "teach fast food photography" and give no formal training. Without a visual contextual background in which to develop their own style the photography becomes a product of the wire with no local cultural contribution. This argument was repeated in interviews with Chad Touré, Mali and Rula Halawani, Palestine.¹⁴ Photographer Paul Lowe comments that wire photographers rarely progress to work on features because they become accustomed to working on single images. "You get your expenses paid, all the latest gear and a front seat at every major news story. On the other hand you don't own your own copyright and you go where they tell you."¹⁵

The feature and stock picture markets have also undergone a transformation. At the beginning of May 2003 JP Morgan reported that Getty Images, a new agency set up in 1995¹⁶ by businessman Jonathan Klein and Mark Getty, grandson of the legendary oilman, had sales of over half a billion US Dollars and more than a 40% share in the stock image market.¹⁷ Its main competition was not the agencies that competed in the early 90's but another new agency, Corbis, set up in 1989 by Bill Gates and now estimated to have a 10% share in the same market.¹⁸ Both agencies had utilized large investment revenues to buy out existing market leaders and introduce new technologies to create what was until then an undefined market. Getty recalls, "I was looking to find a business, which was fragmented worldwide in its application and would be transformed by changes in technology."

Both agencies are based in Seattle, USA but have a slightly different emphasis. The strength of Corbis is editorial whereas Getty has targeted the commercial and advertising markets (Rubythron, 2002 & Cane, 2002).¹⁹ Royes, argues they have other motivations, "Getty wants to dominate the picture industry in the same way his father dominated oil and Gate's agenda is more about the penetration of technology into business."²⁰ Neither claimed to have had an interest in photography before buying into the market.

Both agencies started the process of digitising photography and selling it cheaply on line through searchable databases.²¹ Customers are now able to log on online, put in a keyword search and then browse the pictures found. They are then able to purchase the image and download a high resolution copy. Photographers can submit digital images to the libraries online which has led to both agencies competing directly with the wire agencies, selling both stock and 'up to the minute' images to illustrate newspapers and magazines articles. With shrinking newspaper picture budgets as a result of increased competition from the internet and 24 hour TV news plus a demand for more photographs²² newspapers are now reportedly using stock images in far greater numbers to illustrate stories (Manuelli, 2003, Rubythron, 2002 & Cane, 2002).²³ Colin Jakobson explains that many of the images "are ambiguous" and can therefore be used to illustrate numerous scenarios. They can be bought by publications for as little as US\$17 each and therefore are much cheaper than commissioning the work.²⁴

Digital technology has blurred the lines between the three non-commissioned international picture markets described in the early 1990's leaving five major players all competing in news, features and stock. Associated Press, Agencé France-Presse and Reuters with a specialisation in news and Corbis and Getty Images²⁵ specialising in stock. The feature news picture agencies and stock libraries that survived the Corbis/Getty buy outs and have not gone bankrupt as a result of the new competition have had to modernise and specialise quickly to survive and most are also now competing in all three markets. Paul Lowe explains, "Traditional picture agencies are also filing pictures daily now, so for example Magnum and Seven are competing directly with the wire services as well as Corbis and Getty so there is no longer a middle group doing both jobs, working as wire and magazine photographers simultaneously."²⁶ When asked for images to illustrate international news stories, picture editors go to their computers and begin a search. For major newspapers and news magazines this is likely to include the five major players listed above and possibly some regional and additional smaller agencies with a specialty in that area.²⁷

In theory the technological advances made in the market in the past ten years should have benefited indigenous photographers. Digital photography allows photographers in any location around the world to sell photographs into the international image market by using a computer and phone line. In the case of the news wire services this has occurred, but the same is not true for features and stock. This is primarily due to resources. The culture of news photography has been that the employer supplies the equipment, but freelance photographers who are responsible for buying their own cameras have traditionally supplied feature and stock photography markets. Although economically digital photography is cheaper in the long term than film, the initial outlay is expensive. In the two case studies I conducted in Bangladesh

and Ethiopia the only indigenous photographers that had embraced digital photography were those working for the wire services.²⁸

The Drik picture library in Dhaka has, however, invested in film scanners and is in the process of creating a digital archive. This will in future allow the agency to compete as a specialised international agency through an online database. There was also an abundance of film scanners in Ethiopia but none as yet were being used to scan and send pictures into the international market.

TV, Branding and Ethics

The last subsection deals with other issues that have arisen from technological advances in the international image market.

Since the 1970's television has become the lead instrument of news delivery and the dominant factor in shaping peoples visual understanding of the majority world (Harrison, & Palmer, 1986).²⁹ Vicky Goldberg argued at a presentation to winning photographers at the World Press Photo awards 2003 that photography was more subtle than video and therefore its impact is more enduring. "There is a reason why we don't know the names of TV cameramen and we do know the names of still photographers." This debate is difficult to quantify and for the purpose of this paper my argument is that still photography has an important, if not dominant, role in forming perceptions of the majority world. Television has however changed the way photographers work. As 24 hour live television news inevitably is broadcast before the photographer has the chance to file, the picture editor awaiting the images has already seen the event and formed an opinion of the photographs they should be getting. Given that the images are likely to be coming from the picture agencies and the editor can see all the photographs being filed on his screen, competition between the agency photographers is fierce to be the first and provide the most emotive and dramatic pictures. These are not always the most accurate images. BBC World journalist Nik Gowing, explains the mechanics,

The pressure of real time means we're all fighting for the high ground on what I've called 'the information edge'. It's about being heard, watched and noticed. Hesitate or prevaricate and you lose the initiative. In this rush to seize the high ground and with it a hope for influence, many in this zone of complex emergencies have simply not embraced the virulent, potent, destabilising nature of often poorly-handled information. Much of the handling is frankly too inaccurate and more imbalanced than the handler believes. In the rush for this information edge the temptation is to speculate, to exaggerate, and therefore not to get things as right as the new technology implies we do. (DDZ, 1998)

This concept will be demonstrated in the final section.

Another trend in the image economy that has developed alongside new technologies is that of picture branding. This forms a part of an overall cooperate brand which would normally also include other visual material such as logos, type fonts colours etc. In news the picture brand can have a stronger influence such as the case of the Independent in the 1970's that developed a reputation for alternative angled news

photography. Newspaper picture desks have since strived to have a unique style but Alun John, who was the first picture editor at the Independent newspaper and who shaped the image brand argues that picture editors no longer have the power or budget to do this.³⁰ Colin Jackobson refers to this as a “visual globalisation” which essentially makes all global news coverage the same.³¹ Vicky Goldberg recalls a recent major news story when three leading US news magazines published “a similar, almost identical image on the cover”³².

As news image branding has slowly disappeared, image branding in other fields such as tourism and NGO publications³³ has started to increase. This is due to the fact that designers can now search Getty, Corbis and smaller competing stock agencies online to find particular styles of images that fit an agreed brand. Cheralyn Kirkwood, designer at the Grand Vacation Company, explained the process. “We have a corporate style that uses images of people in their 20’s – 30’s enjoying themselves on holiday with yellow as the dominant colour. Before we would commission photographers from the UK to tour our resorts and take pictures, whereas now we tend to search the stock libraries for pictures that fit our brand.”³⁴ This development in theory gives indigenous photographers new opportunities to sell into markets that were previously closed to them.

The final issue in this section that I would like to comment on is the change in ethical policies that has developed through the introduction of digitised photographs. Ever since National Geographic used a computer to move the Egyptian pyramids closer together in 1982 so they could fit them on a cover (Lutz & Collins, 1993) digital manipulation has become the key ethical issue in the image market. The news wire services enforce strict electronic ethics policies and sack any photographers that breach them (Horton, 2001). The recent case of Los Angeles Times photographer Brian Walski, being dismissed instantly after it was noticed that a picture of his published on the front page of the newspaper on the 31st March 2003 was a montage of two images (several people appeared twice in the image) demonstrates the papers need to protect the authority of their photography in an age where the public understand the ease in which images can be altered. This policy has had an even greater effect on indigenous photographers filing from remote areas who are reportedly not trusted by the central bureaux picture editors. Bangladeshi photographer Rafiqur Rahman explains,

Reuters is very strict about any manipulation of an image. I can change the brightness and contrast only, before sending to the main office. There are many stories of photographers who made just minor changes, for example removing a plug socket from the wall behind a person picture in photoshop, and were fired instantly. I once took a picture of a protest in support of Bin Laden. The protestors were holding up a poster which had amongst many other things a very small print of Bart Simpson on it. The US State department were convinced I had added this to the picture and accused me of interfering with the picture. I had to run all over Dhaka to find an original poster and then send our Singapore office copies to prove the picture was real otherwise I too would have been fired.³⁵

In this section I have explained the makeup of the image economy in the early 1990’s and discussed the changes that have taken place in the past decade. I have

argued that new technologies have increased the ability of indigenous photographers to engage in the international image economy, but as yet this is only happening in the news wire services.

2./ The Growth of Indigenous Photography in the Majority World

In the last section I explained that the introduction of new technologies and financial restrictions on picture editors to send staff photographers overseas have improved the opportunities for indigenous photographers to sell pictures internationally. In this section I will outline arguments for and against local photographers, their political standing in their own countries and the issue of photographic culture. I will give a general overview of the current development of majority world photography and then use case studies in Ethiopia and Bangladesh to evaluate the arguments.

Local Photographers, Politics and Culture

A local photographer might be able to put more feelings into a picture and has better local knowledge, however a British photographer working for a British publication understands and uses the language of the readership and this leads to a clearer message. If your intention is to say this is a local photographer and this is his viewpoint then you need to use a local photographer. (Jon Levy, Editor Foto8)³⁶

Panos Pictures director, Adrian Evans, who is under pressure from the Panos Institute to use more local photographers, agrees with Levy and explains in his experience the problem is often more to do with infrastructure than quality. "It's a question of compositional grammar, which you have to know to operate in this world. A lot of places in Africa, they just don't know the grammar."³⁷

Linda Royes also raises legal and financial ambiguities in international image trade, which create barriers for direct photographer to client negotiations. She argues the lack of standardisation in Europe alone makes inter European image sales complex.³⁸ These barriers are however removed if the photographer works with an agency rather than directly with a publication, as the agency is then responsible for legal and financial negotiations.

Drik director, Shahidul Alam, disputes these arguments and claims there is a wealth of motivated, talented indigenous photographers who simply have not been discovered (Alam, 1994). What his photography school refers too as the "western eye" is simply a visual language that can be taught like English or French. In one of two interviews conducted with him he went on to list examples where the indigenous photographer was able to get better access and a better understanding and therefore more accurate pictures of a situation. In all the interviews I conducted with local photographers examples were given of when their local knowledge played a key role in getting important images.

One of the greatest barriers to photographers in the majority world has been political influence. Images are generally regarded as secondary to text and are given little space or respect in newsprint. Alun John explains the system in Tanzania, "You sit exams to join various professions. If you got the highest pass you became a civil

servant, if you were mid stream you became a journalist and if you didn't pass any of the exams they gave you a camera."³⁹ John argues that improving photography is not about training photographers but changing the attitudes of the publishers towards photography.⁴⁰ National Geographic conducted research that concluded that 53% of their readers only looked at the pictures (Lutz and Collins, 1993) backing John's argument that pictures play an important role in story telling.

Every two years African photographers gather in Bamako, Mali to show and discuss their work. Festival organiser Chab Touré introduced the concept of regional African photographic culture and claimed this was an important element of the work. "Photographers in northern Africa are more concerned with social subjects, like women. In West Africa they prefer portraits and I think South Africa is more reportage."⁴¹ Touré claims the international success of Mali portrait photographers Seydou and Malick Sidibé was due to an acquired appreciation by international galleries and publications who opened themselves up to the photographic culture. Evans acknowledges the Mali portraits but claims this is an individual case, which he has not seen repeated from other African photographers.⁴²

Levy argues photographic culture is more to do with individual style than the place the photographer originates from. He makes reference to Czechoslovakian photographer, Josef Koudelka's pictures of Wales.

Only Josef Koudelka could have taken these pictures in that way as it was applying his art and vision to a place and that is something to be gained, a different opinion about it if you will. The issue is therefore raised whether the pictures should depict an accurate reality of a place or the photographer's impression of it? A photographer that does not know that much about the reality of an issue or situation will rely on the visual stimulus that they get and they will start translating that into images based on first opinion. Some magazines are happy with this and will hire a well known photographer to travel to a country for them because they want his style and interpretation. Where as if you want something factual you will probably turn to someone with the most knowledge.

Growth of Indigenous Photography

Before moving onto the case studies I would first like to consider an overall view of photography in the majority world. Interviews conducted with the Thompson Foundation (UK), World Press Photo (Holland) and The Reuters Foundation (UK) all of which have expert knowledge in the field report an increase in the number of photographers practising, training courses available and the quality of photography produced.

The director of World Press photo, Michiel Munneke noted that the 2002 chairman of the award jury and the overall winner were both from "less developing countries"⁴³. It is however important to note that both those mentioned have spent a good deal of time in the UK and USA respectively, as this will become a repeated theme in the case studies.

Photographers Rula Halawani (Palestine) and Paul Lowe (currently living in Bosnia) both refer to the fact that conflict and the development of photography have happened simultaneously. Halawani claims the influx of foreign photographers has brought about radical improvements in local photography, “we learn from these guys”.⁴⁴ Lowe reports that young Bosnian photographers experienced in covering war were now being used in Afghanistan and Iraq.⁴⁵

All of the arguments raised will be critically evaluated through the case studies.

Case Studies

In this section I have started a number of opposing arguments on the use of indigenous photographers. Through the two case studies I will critically evaluate,

1. Whether local photographers in the majority world understand the visual language of the international image economy.
2. Whether there exists an identifiable regional visual language apparent in the photography.
3. The status of photographers within their local culture.
4. If there are indications of a growth of indigenous photography in the country.

The two case studies were chosen to represent opposite ends of accepted photographic development. In an initial survey of overseas development offices and picture agencies in London, I was unable to find anyone who knew of an Ethiopian photographer. Bangladesh is however well known for its photography, principally through the reputation of the Drik picture library.

Ethiopia

Historian Ricahrd Pankhurst gives a detailed account of the development of photography in Ethiopia, between 1867 and 1935 (Pankhurst, 1996). While photographers were reported to be working professionally in Addis Ababa as early as 1905 there is no mention of an Ethiopian photographer. The market was instead dominated by Armenians and travelling European's. The first professional Ethiopian photographer I was able to find was Negash Wolde Amanuel. Born in 1931, Negash describes flourishing amateur photography in the 1950's when Ethiopian troops serving in Korea, returned with box cameras bought en route in Japan. Negash trained as a photographer in New York and went on to work for Time/Life for five years before returning to Ethiopia to set up as a photographer (*Revue Noire – African Contemporary Art*, April 1997).

Emperor Haile Sellassie's strict regime followed by the Marxist Derg government made it difficult for photographers to work publicly. It was in fact the latter's rule that drove Ethiopian's abroad and ironically had the greatest influence on Ethiopian photography today. Five photographers, who currently work at an international level, all gained photographic training while in exile in Europe and America and have recently returned to set up in business. All understand the language of international publications and all reflect the photographic culture where they trained rather than demonstrate a uniquely Ethiopian style.⁴⁶

Of these five photographers, two are currently working sporadically for associated press and another with American adventure travel magazines. One photographer's business partner left during my research visit to the USA and UK to promote and sell his photography to international agencies. Although Internet connectivity is slow, all five photographers had web access and were well resourced with the technology needed to sell their work via the web. It is likely that within the next two years all five photographers will be trading their images internationally.

Other Ethiopian Photographers who remained during the Derg demonstrated work relevant to the local market but below the standard required by international publications. During folio viewings and interviews I was not able to identify a style that was culturally significant.⁴⁷ Every Ethiopian photographer I interviewed was male.

The acceptance of photography as a credible tool of news delivery in Ethiopia was limited. Newspapers print few photographs and regard the photographer as an accessory to a written journalist. Photographers interviewed reported they maintained a low profile in Ethiopian society. Tamrat Giorgis, editor of the weekly newspaper *The Fortune*, had recently used photography more prominently and was reporting increased sales. Giorgis argued that other papers were already seeing the impact and were adjusting picture use accordingly. He predicted a rapid change over the coming year.⁴⁸ Growth in photography training is also positive. Three photography colleges have recently been opened offering one year diploma courses. *Masters*, the biggest of the three is due to see 1,500 students graduate this year from three campus'.

Bangladesh

Bangladesh has a rich history of indigenous photographers and exists within a sophisticated Asian culture of news and magazine production. "They say Canada is the country of wheat, well Bangladesh must be the country of news."⁴⁹ Shahidul Alam, who studied as a scientist in the UK, has successfully sustained a global protest for the recognition of Bangladeshi photographers. His organisation, Drik, has expanded from a small two person photographic agency to a large media organisation serving a predominantly local market. As referred in section one, *New Technologies, Gates and Getty*, Drik's picture library is poised to join other specialist agencies, trading stock and feature images on line.

What is unique about Drik is its sister training academy, Pathshala, which offers short courses and a full three year degree in photography. Graduates from the school are of mixed gender and are already working internationally. One graduate was chosen last year for the World Press Photo master class.

The photographers working at Drik each showed folios of tear sheets from international publications where their work had been published. They clearly demonstrated an understanding of the market. I was not however shown evidence of a Bangladeshi style. The image construction appeared to be in the tradition of American and European documentary. There was evidence of pictures that only a local photographer is likely to have gained access to, particularly in sensitive areas. I was told repeatedly in interviews of the low status photographers held in the country.

This was evident by the fact all students interviewed at the school had already graduated from a local university or were studying simultaneously as their parents did not believe photography could provide a viable future. The growth of photography in Bangladesh was apparent but more gradual than in Ethiopia.

In this section I argue in both case studies that skilled practising photographers do exist who understand the language of the international image economy and are already engaging with it at different levels. I saw no evidence of a unique country specific cultural style in either study but rather proof of visual globalisation. The status of photographers within both societies is low, though improving and there is strong evidence to suggest numbers and quality of indigenous photographers is increasing.

3./ Context, Power and Style

In this section I look first at the issue of context in reference to the minority world's visual perceptions of the majority world and discuss the relationship between news and realism. I then investigate the motivations, power and political influences in the globalised image economy. I finally discuss the role played by the photographer in the construction of the image and debate questions of subject dignity, stereotypes and religious iconography.

Context

In the film *One Hour Photo*, Robin Williams' character observes: 'Family photos depict smiling faces, births, weddings, holidays, children's birthday parties. People take pictures of the happy moments in their lives. Someone looking through our photo album would conclude that we had led a joyous leisurely existence, free of tragedy. No one ever takes a photograph of something they want to forget.'

In contrast to our personal use of the camera the news photographer does the exact opposite, snapping disasters, wars, famines and funerals. Anyone paging through the newspaper with no other context in which to put these events will naturally conclude that people living in these countries lead a life of misery and despair.

News presenter George Alagiah argues that the vast majority of his audience has no experience of the places in Africa from where he reported and therefore no ability to contextualise the account. However Alagiah points out "to isolate news and expect it to do everything, to inform, to educate, establish connectivity is just too much." (Holland, 2002). An audience gains understanding of place through a fusion of history, geography and current affairs from which a more rounded understanding can be formed. In the case of the majority world, the public's understanding is dominated by news and therefore imbalanced.

Jon Madul Jok, speaking at the *Dispatches from Disaster Zones* conference disagrees and believes the reporting of news should include a wider context that embraces investigations into the causes and peoples lived experiences (DDZ, 1998). In television this may be argued but photographers who work within a single image

and a single sentence caption have little space to depict the occurrence let alone the cause.

Susan Sontag states that, "For more than a century, photographers have been hovering about the oppressed, in attendance at scenes of violence - with a spectacularly good conscience. Social misery has inspired the comfortably-off with the urge to take pictures, the gentlest of predations, in order to document a hidden reality that is, a reality hidden from them." (Sontag, 79). Sean Kenny argues that this obsession with negative imagery of the majority world lies in the colonial past. Images of too much modernity in the majority world makes the relationship between "us and them" difficult both economically and psychologically (Kenny, 2000). Alam confirms the demand for such pictures stating the most frequently requested images of Bangladesh that come to his library at Drik are those of "floods, cyclones and slums." The library contains a vast range of subjects on Bangladesh including, for example, people working with computer terminals which has never been requested internationally (Alam, 1994). Evans reports a very different scenario at Panos Pictures, "In Africa there are two styles often talked about. There is Afro Romanism and there is Afro Pessimism and that is all you see... If you come up with something very good from Africa that isn't the romantic or pessimistic, it sells. People just don't think about doing it." Evans went on to list his best selling stories of recent years which all were of everyday rounded subjects.⁵⁰

The statistics published in *Images of Africa* (Van der Gaag, and Nash, 1985), and the *Live Aid Legacy* (VSO, 2001) and backed up from statements by Alam (1994) demonstrate that the British public at all levels still associate the majority world with negative imagery. What is of particular interest is that people born after 1984 (the last major Ethiopian famine) still associate the country with famine, although they were not witness to the event or Live Aid that followed. South African photographer Neo Ntsoma explains "there are books and duplications, you only need to see one of these pictures one time and the name Africa written next to it and you will never forget." This supports Vicky Goldberg's argument of the still image lingering.⁵¹

Power

In section one I have argued that the international image economy is dominated by five major picture agencies, now competing in news, features and stock photography. Other smaller agencies have followed suit but found niche areas of the market in which to concentrate. These agencies operate throughout the world and are producing what Jacobson has termed a "globalised view" of the world. In this section I have argued this view is predominantly negative of the majority world. I will now discuss the forces that shape that market and how this leads to the demand for particular types of images.

As the image market has transferred from physical to digital so the capacity for images has expanded. Photographers anywhere in the world can now take a picture and load it into searchable databases for publications to consider. The act of placing the image on the market though does not guarantee a sale. Evans calls this "the agenda" and makes it clear that neither him nor the photographers set the agenda. This is done by the publications. He bemoans the fact that many of what he regards to be the best stories the agency has produced have never sold.⁵² Eamonn McCabe

argues the case that the photographer's job is not to make decisions on what to shoot and what not to. "photographers shoot everything they see, often not knowing a picture's significance." It is up to the editor to make the choice of what to publish.⁵³ Photographer Simon Norfolk who has tried to take and sell pictures of what he believes to be important issues despairs the fact that America is the biggest buyer of photography and any photographer that ignores the American interest market will find it hard to survive. He belittles his success in coffee table book publishing and exhibiting claiming "7,000 people will buy my book and that is a big print run, but more people will turn up to watch Oldham draw 0-0 on a Wednesday night."⁵⁴ He therefore implies that in order for a photographer to succeed financially and get their photography seen by a mass audience they have to acknowledge the US dominated global market and produce pictures for its needs.

Lowe describes the global news market being driven by a single image that an average housewife in Detroit can understand and therefore built on American aspirations.⁵⁵ Horton advises photojournalists to know and understand their market, "A1, inside, secondary play, the feature section" (Horton, 2001) but in the case of a global market this is far more complex. If you are a staff photographer for the Sun or the Financial Times you will have a clear idea about who your audience is but modern day global news photographers have a universal audience. American broadcaster Ed Murrow explains the concept as "being understood by the truck driver but not upsetting the professor's intelligence." (DFID, 2002) In the case of Ethiopia, which has become synonymous with famine, when there is a drought in Africa photographers naturally gravitate to Ethiopia to tell the story. Charles Elliot, former director of Christian Aid, recalls trying to persuade journalists to go to the Sudan as early as September 1984, to cover the famine there. The response he got, he recalls, "but that's not news, Ethiopia is news. Don't tell me to go to Sudan, give me an angle on Ethiopia." (Magistad, 1985)

In my the study in Bangladesh I found that although Drik retained a strong ideological standpoint and trained all its photographers in issues of globalisation, visual representation, colonialism, visual anthropology etc in order to avoid negative stereotyping, it was another photographer, Rafiqur Rahman who held the greatest responsibility for the countries representation. As both a still photographer and cameraman for Reuters, his images were beamed around the world on a daily basis and played in international newspapers and TV stations. He had no doubt about what he was aiming to file. "Reuters want real pictures, the truth but they also want strong pictures. I know the type of picture that sells and I supply the office."⁵⁶

At the time of my research visit, the Iraq war was still in its latter stages and I had been frightened by some of Rafiqur's images I had seen in the British press before leaving the UK. In particular, one photograph of an angry Islamic fundamentalist waving a gun in Dhaka. I visited a similar demonstration after I arrived in Bangladesh and saw the same character in the front row with thousands of peaceful protesters behind him. I showed Rafiqur the image I was referring to and asked why his pictures did not represent the whole.

I know this man, he has turned up to every anti American protest for the last 6 – 7 years, but the gun is a toy, I know as I have been very close. He always makes a very strong picture but I am clear in the caption that the gun is a toy.

The problem is not all news editors use my caption and the meaning gets lost. News is news, it happens, positive and negative I do not control the news or the way the final picture is used, I just try to tell the truth. You have to remember that newspaper editors are businessmen who are trying to make money and give their political opinion. They modify reports and choose pictures according to their own agendas.⁵⁷

Syed Shujauddin Ahmed, director general of the national institute of mass communication in Dhaka argues that Muslim bashing is currently a saleable commodity and photographers working within the international market are therefore looking for those images. He concedes Islamic fundamentalism is a problem in Bangladesh but only represents 4-5% of the population. The ratio of images depicting this that come out of Bangladesh is far higher.

As well as market forces dictating the construction of saleable images, media owners, governments and influential personalities can also interfere in the market for political gain. Piers Robinson argues that the "CNN Effect: the saturation of Western viewers with non-stop, real-time news footage of wars and military actions on television and the Internet." In turn this coverage can persuade governments to act. (Robinson 2002) This interference will be tested in the final section.

Style

If market forces and political interference are the factors that dictate what images are sold, this implies the photographer plays no part in the process of representation. However the photographer makes many decisions in the process of capturing and editing a picture. Brett Rodgers, British council photography director explains,

A critical stream of theoretical work, arising from post-structuralist insights found in the works of Baudrillard to Barthes, Foucault and Sontag has led to a wide-spread rejection of the idea that acts of looking or recording can ever be neutral or disinterested, but are embedded in relationships of power and control. Just as to different people from the same family never have the identical memories of the same family event, two different photographers produce entirely distinct images in front of the same scene, because they bring their own personal assumptions, background and experience to the situation.⁵⁸

Tom Stoddart argues that the truest form of documentary photography is that of the long lens paparazzi who retains no relationship with their subject as they are unaware of his presence.⁵⁹

Photographers use learnt visual strategies to construct a working methodology which if successful they repeat on different assignments. Lowe argues that many contemporary strategies derive from the art world and can often leave the viewer more confused than enlightened. With an emphasis on aesthetics, photographers can cover up for their lack of knowledge and leave the reader with a feel "of somewhere in black Africa....Chaotic, fractured, complex, blur, out of focus images tend to make places look like that. They make places look mad, chaotic where

nothing can be solved and when you apply that to Sierra Leone or Palestine for example the viewer assumes these places are beyond help.”⁶⁰

Alam, writing a few years earlier describes similar strategies but using a different format of wide angle, black and white, grainy, high contrast images. (Alam 1994) Evans claims that some photographers now openly admit to setting pictures up to accentuate the drama leading to formalistic images made to order.⁶¹ Given that stock libraries now operate within the same database as news this appears to be the first indication of traditional markets beginning to merge.

Another common but repeated photographer's trait is what Alun John refers to as the “Casablanca Option ..that is, rounding up all the usual suspects.”⁶² When in Sierra Leone it was presumed he would want to visit the amputee camp and in Beirut he was offered a trip to Shatila but preferred to look for more positive stories.⁶³ More commonly referred to as the “stereotype” this has been lambasted by many of the publications in my reading list and has led to the word having negative connotations. However the use of familiar (stereotypical) images in advertising has long been used to reinforce the quality of products and services and is only seen as negative in this case because of the unconstructive associations. Photographers are accused of looking to find familiar images without investigating the true situation. Neo Ntsoma explains her experience,

When a photographer from Time or Newsweek or any of the big international publications comes to South Africa they come to our paper as we are known for our photography. I have been asked to go out with some of these photographers to show them around, but they are only interested in the poverty in our country. They have seen pictures from other photographers and they want to go these places to get these pictures.⁶⁴

Alagiah explains familiar coverage by the term “ template reporting”. This involves in the case of famine, for example, a set formula that includes “the emaciated child, preferably crying; you've got to have a feeding centre, where mothers with shrunken breasts are trying to calm their children; you've got to have an aid worker, usually white, usually a woman who is working against the odds”⁶⁵ This image translates directly to still photography where similar unwritten templates exist. Goldberg believes that what is left out of the picture is as important as what is left in.⁶⁶ Peter Stalker agrees recalling his experience as a photojournalist covering famine.

There was no point, say, in showing families eating - however meagre the meal - otherwise they would not appear hungry. And they should not be smiling at the camera, even though it is quite possible to smile and be hungry at the same time. It was better also to concentrate on children since hungry adults who are listless because tired or anaemic can come across in a photograph as lazy or irresponsible (Stalker, 1998).

I will revisit the template in the final section.

Like the stereotype the question of the subjects dignity is another theme frequently discussed. Nash and Van Der Gaag refer to the imagery from the 1984 famine as being ‘truly pornographic’ and ask whether the subject's permission to photograph

had been granted or not. They suggest even if the subjects did object they were not in an emotional or physical state to make their protest known. The *Images of Africa* report concludes the photographic practice had been predatory and demeaning and that the Ethiopians images had been used to sell newspapers and raise funds without regard for the dignity of those pictured. Photographers preyed on women and children as these made a more dramatic image (Nash & Van Der Gaag, 1987). This issue is frequently raised but without the resources to question those photographed.

The final issue I would like to discuss in this section is that of the “aestheticization of poverty”⁶⁷ through Christian iconography. Biblical images of the Madona and child, Christ on the cross, Christ the healer, the mighty famines are replicated by photographers every time disaster strikes and justified through the Christian tradition of imaging suffering. Nash and Van Der Gaag demonstrate this through statistical percentages of woman and child images in the media reports from Korem, but fail to give details of the gender makeup of the camp. Tafarri Wossan who took many of the journalists to Korem claims “there were very few men at the camp as they would go and search for work, it is also not in these people’s culture for the man to hold the baby and therefore images of man and child would have been hard to find.”⁶⁸

In this section I have argued that imaging the poor and oppressed is a tradition of photography that goes back to its invention. This practice is regarded acceptable as long as those images are viewed in context with a rounded understanding of the issues and culture in which the events occur. In the case of the majority world an imbalance has been created by a dominance in news, leading to a largely negative view. Recent developments in the image economy⁶⁹ has led to a globalised photography market that is currently driven by dominant world economic and political forces. This has simplified the photographers outlook and led to a greater reliability on familiar imagery. Influence from the art world and the stock library market has also led to increased ascetic imagery often used to cover the photographers lack of understanding of the issues at hand.

All the matters raised in this section will be analysed in section four in relation to the case study.

4./ The Green Famine and the image of Mekanik Philopos

This case study is based on interviews with the following people, all of whom were present during the May 2003 Bob Geldof visit to Ethiopia. Soraya Bermejo (UNICEF media officer based in London), Shanta Bloeman (UNICEF communication officer based in Addis Ababa), Mahimbo Mode (UNICEF emergency manager in Ethiopia), John Graham (Programme Director, Save the Children, UK, Ethiopia office), Antonio Fiorente (Associated press Photographer). Interviews were also conducted with Bezunesh Abraham (mother of Mekanik Philopos, both of whom feature in the case photograph) and Mesfin Marium (the paediatrician at the Yirba thereputic feeding centre, where the case photograph was taken). Names are only referenced in cases where the information given is disputed or only represents the opinion of one interviewee.

Background

On Monday 26th May 2003 Sir Bob Geldof flew from London to Addis Ababa to begin a five day tour of the country. There was a drought in the horn of Africa and Ethiopia was once again dependent on food aid. Geldof's trip, facilitated by UNICEF and Save the Children, was focussed on using the media to persuade the G8 summit (scheduled to begin on the weekend following the visit) to discuss issues in Africa. Geldof claimed success at the end of the visit,

The week before we came here and all this week every TV station and newspaper in America and Europe were full of our stories. The G8 could have got away with not talking about Africa, they could have talked about Iraq and declare they are all friends now. So it does work. You force this thing, you force it on to the agenda. So they have to deal with it. And unbelievably there are good things happening in G8 now. It is working.⁷⁰

Geldof was accompanied on the trip by Lucy Matthews from the organisation DATA, a political lobbying organisation set up and run by Geldof and U2 singer Bono. Matthews was there to advise Geldof on how to deal with the press. The problem they faced was the fact there was a drought in Ethiopia but no famine.

If you crudely divide Ethiopia into North and South with Addis Ababa in the centre. The north, which is historically prone to famine has built an efficient infrastructure of predicting food shortages and distributing before people went hungry. Save the Children who worked in that area wanted to use the Geldof trip to get the message across that their role in dealing with food shortages was successful.

The south of Ethiopia which is renowned for its lush vegetation had a nutritional problem caused by the rains coming at the wrong time. A destruction of the staple food (a false banana) occurred through disease and then when the maize was supposed to flower there was not enough rain for the flower to produce maize. As a result of this series of events there was food, but with a nutritional imbalance which meant many babies did not get the foods they needed to grow. UNICEF employed Professor Mike Golden, an expert nutritionist to devise a 21 day feeding programme to correct the imbalance and set up therapeutic feeding centres (TFC's) in the affected areas. In 1984 such skills and infrastructure was not available and many of the affected children would have died. The message UNICEF wished to convey was that there was a problem with malnutrition (not lack of food but the wrong food) but in 97% of cases there system was returning affected babies to normal health within the three week programme.

Gedof's visit was divided into daily sections, Tuesday to meet with officials and visit a poor neighbourhood in Addis Ababa, Wednesday to travel south to see the Yirba TFC near Awasa, Thursday to continue south to visit anti-aids clubs and the prevention of Mother to Child Transmission programme at Dilla hospital and Friday to fly north to revisit the area of the 1984 famine and see how the situation was now being dealt with.

The Photographers

A number of Ethiopian news photographers took pictures at the official receptions in Addis Ababa but only five photographers followed Geldof south. They were,

Antonio Fiorente – Ethiopian photographer working for Associated Press
Antony Njuguna – Kenyan photographer working for Reuters
Arthur Edwards – Flew out with Geldof and worked exclusively for *The Sun*.
Eddie Mulholland – Flew out with Geldof and worked exclusively for *The Daily Telegraph*
Stephen Morrison – A Canadian photographer working for European Pressphoto Agency (EPA) who was recently sent to Nairobi to open an Africa Office. EPA was set up in 1985 and provides photographs to European publications. Based in Frankfurt EPA has strong ties to AFP.⁷¹

A number of print journalists also accompanied the visit as well as TV camera crews from Reuters, Associated press, Sky and the BBC.

The Photograph

Many images were published during the five day tour but the most played photograph in the international press was that of Geldof handing baby Mekanic Philopos back to his mother Bezunesh Abraham in the Yirba TFC on Wednesday 28th May 2003⁷². All the photographers took this picture of which I have seen three versions.⁷³ The following accounts describe what happened,

Shantha Bloeman,

Well we got to this site and it was late in the day, not late but late to file stories. I had forgotten about the fact these people needed to file everyday and the urgency of that process. Geldof wanted to be in the paper everyday so it was important for us to respect this. This place is 3 ½ hours south of Addis so we got there and the journalists wanted to work quick so they could file. They kept saying we don't have time to waste. So we got to this place where there are three tents (three phases) so this first one was the acute phase one, where children are admitted when they first arrive. Basically it is a large tent, about 25-30 metres long, like one of those army tents with women hanging around on the mattress'. ... There were five journalists, five photographers and no one wanted to leave before their competition. So I end up shouting more and the whole thing was very fraught. So we tried to interchange between TV and the print and photographers in this tent.... Stephen (EPA Photographer) kept saying, these pictures aren't dramatic enough, my office wants dramatic pictures. He wanted me to take him to places where livestock were dying, and when I said there was no such places, he replied "there is no story for me then."

Antonio Fiorente,

I was instructed to follow Bob Geldof, everywhere he went and everything he did. We were looking to capture that moment. There were other people from AP with us who gave us instructions. It was mad. Lots of photographers and TV news people pushing each other, sitting or standing in the way of my lens... This baby was very badly malnourished and the UNICEF guide brought him (Geldof) across to see the baby. The guide picked the baby up and

handed him to Geldof who handed him back to his mother. This was the picture. He did not pick up any other babies on the trip, just stroked them but the reason this picture was so strong is the fact the baby is much worse than others we saw...there was a lot of competition between Reuters and AP. Our advantage was we had our own car and did not travel with UNICEF, so we could go at any time we liked. So we could have the advantage of being able to send first.

Mahimbo Mode,

There was a lot of pressure from London. They were all in communication with their sat phones. In particular Sky who were doing live broadcasts and the print media were immediately under pressure to cover the same issues. That is Sky would interview Clare Short or Tony Blair and then go live to Ethiopia. The print media would be talking to their offices in London who were watching the Sky broadcast and getting instructions to concentrate on the same issues.... there was no desire to include or explain the problem they were just focussed on going straight to a TFC and getting pictures of babies.

Deconstruction

The image correlates almost exactly to the Alagiah template, re enforcing a familiar message of famine in Ethiopia replacing the white aid worker with Geldof. The above accounts of the circumstances in which the image was made confirm theories of orders being sent to photographers from editors watching live television broadcasts. Competition between agencies leads to speed and drama becoming the driving force behind the photographers approach to the subject rather than a need for accuracy. For those filing to global audiences deadlines occur every hour as the timeline moves across the world. Missing the Paris or London 10 PM deadline would often mean the image was never published as 24 hours is a long time in news. This also led to a very similar image being filed by all the photographers. There were no attempts made to contextualise the image. Audiences in the UK who looked at this image were left with the impression that this baby was starving, this baby was going to die, and this baby was representative of thousands of Ethiopian children. All of which were not true. Text in *The Daily Mirror* and *The Sun* (which cropped the mother out) reinforced these messages⁷⁴

The image does not however appear to use noticeable visual strategies. The picture is very literal and simply composed. The religious symbolism is strong with Geldof, the Christ figure reaching out to heal the child held in the mother's arms. An image the average "housewife in Detroit" would have no problem in comprehending.

Geldof, who in his first visit to Ethiopia in 1984 "refused ... to be photographed with a starving child.." (Harrison & Palmer, 1986). had reformed his approach and was now looking for malnourished children to be photographed with. He claims the trip was successful in bringing Africa into the agenda for the G8 summit and therefore demonstrated a strong CNN effect. However the G8 declaration makes little mention of Africa and two of the aid workers interviewed were disappointed with the outcome.⁷⁵ Conversely both UNICEF and Save the Children both expressed delight at the outcome of the visit reporting financial and political gains that would not have

come otherwise. Graham argued that similar trips made by Princess Anne and Michael Buerk earlier in the year had little effect compared to Geldof.

In regard to the indigenous photographer's perspective. Antonio's Fiorente's images show equal quality and skill to the others on the trip but no alternative perspective. His expense form was no doubt much shorter than the other photographers and his local knowledge and car meant that he had a slight time advantage but other than that he conformed to the visual image expected and delivered.

Finally I address the question of Bezunesh Abraham's dignity. Mesfin Marium, the paediatrician at the Yirba TFC explained that in his opinion the visit and photographs were seen as a great privilege by those involved. He estimated that 4,000 local villagers had turned up to watch the proceedings and there was a lot of excitement. He also noted that the caption that ran with the image in the Daily Mirror (but not in the Herald and Tribune) had exaggerated the figure of babies treated from 400 to 4,000. I interviewed Abraham four weeks after the event and on the day before her baby was released, fit and healthy, from the Beshuto Health centre, Awasa⁷⁶ Below is the transcript, translated by Sawra Tafari,

Clark: What is your opinion of this picture?

Abraham: "I give thanks to God for this picture because it helped save the life of my son."

Clark: Were you aware of the picture being taken and that it might be published worldwide?

Abraham: Yes I knew, because they explained to us before they came to visit us what would happen.

Clark: Do you feel embarrassed by this picture at all?

Abraham: No I don't feel embarrassed, why should I?

Abraham clearly felt that having her picture taken contributed to the well being of her son and therefore happily obliged. Given that UNICEF benefited from the coverage and were responsible for her son's medical treatment this appears to be justified. Fiorente's contact sheet of the event shows a variation of facial expressions including her smiling, but all those published show a look of despair. Abraham was not troubled by this and asked for a copy to put in her home.

Figure 1: Bob Geldof hands baby Mechanic Philipos back to his mother Bezunesh Abraham at the Yirba TFC, Photograph by Antony Njuguna/Reuters 28.5.03



Figure 2: Bezunesh Abraham with baby Mechanic Philipos at the Beshuto Health centre, Awasa, Photograph D.J. Clark 25.6.03



Conclusion

In this paper I have described the image economy in the early 1990's and argued that a radical change has taken place over the last ten years as a result of new investors and the introduction of new technologies. These changes have brought about the growth of visual globalisation by allowing the economy to directly affect the content of the image. This argument is proved through the case study in section four where I deconstruct the image of Mekanik Philipos published in the UK at the end of May 2003.

I have looked in detail at the issue of indigenous photographers and their relationship to the international image economy and argued that although there are clear signs of growing numbers of photographers in the majority world trading in the picture economy they are not taking control of the photographic representation of their country but rather conforming to the globalised perspective. This is still dominated by minority world buying power and therefore continues to reflect an American/European understanding of the world. Economic pressures and new competition with alternative news dissemination is creating a broader spectrum of photographers and a better quality of photography from the majority world but this has not yet been repeated in feature and stock image markets.

The Mekanik Philipos case study also demonstrates issues of subject dignity are not as clear as argued by Nash and Van der Gaag. In *Images of Africa* Nash and Van der Gaag are horrified by the 'pornographic' imagery that preyed on the weak and suffering in 1984 and implied that those photographed were horrified at the imaging experience. In my case study Philipos's mother sees the imaging experience as her way of helping her child. This is reflected by UNICEF and Save the Children who argue that such images, though horrific bring real changes to their work in these areas.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS: This essay has benefited greatly from the critical comments, readings and suggestions provided by David Campbell. For providing the travel that made this research possible, I am grateful to the Winston Churchill Trust for the award of a Traveling Fellowship in 2003. I am also very grateful for the time given by all those interviewed.⁷⁷

¹ Also argued by Mr Tafari Wossan, interview with the author, Awasa, Ethiopia, June 2003

² Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003

³ Linda Royles, Maganging director, British Association of Picture Libraries and Agencies, interview with the author, London, UK, June 2003

⁴ Source: <http://www.ap.org/pages/history/photos.htm>

⁵ Source: <http://www.reuters.com>

⁶ AP has 1,700 subscription publications in the USA alone Source: <http://www.ap.org>

⁷ Source: <http://afp.com>

⁸ The author worked for short periods as a photographer for all three agencies between 1989 and 1991. This statement is based on that experience, information at <http://www.ap.org/pages/history/photos.htm> and Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.

⁹ Rafiqur Rahman, Reuters cameraman/photographer, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2003

¹⁰ Rula Halawani, Reuters photographer 1991-2001, telephone interview with the author, Jerusalem, May 2003

-
- ¹¹ Linda Royles, Maganging director, British Association of Picture Libraries, interview with the author, London, UK, June 2003
- ¹² Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003
- ¹³ Also stated by Colin Jacobson, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ¹⁴ Pablo Bartholomew, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003, Rula Halawani, Reuters photographer 1991-2001, telephone interview with the author, Jerusalem, May 2003, Chab Touré, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ¹⁵ Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ¹⁶ Getty Investments was set up in 1993 but did not start to trade in stock photography until 1995
- ¹⁷ Tom Rubython, 2002 & Alan Cane, 2002 claim this to be only 25% according to figures estimated by Getty and Klein. Figures are hard to estimate as Getty remains the only picture agency listed on the stock market.
- ¹⁸ JP Morgan, US Equity Research, May 2001, <http://mm.jpmorgan.com>
- ¹⁹ Also see <http://www.gettyimages.com> & <http://www.corbis.com>
- ²⁰ Linda Royles, Maganging director, British Association of Picture Libraries and Agencies, interview with the author, London, UK, June 2003
- ²¹ Getty Images did not start the process as such, but rather bought the company Photo Desk and made their interface their own.
- ²² Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003, Colin Jacobson, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003 & Lightbox, Issue five, *News Style*, June 1998
- ²³ Also Lightbox, Issue five, *News Style*, June 1998
- ²⁴ Colin Jacobson, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ²⁵ On the 1st April 2003, Getty Images and AFP announced a “strategic relationship to increase breadth, depth and quality” (http://corporate.gettyimages.com/pr/release.asp?prid=2003_04_01)
- ²⁶ Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ²⁷ Lightbox, Issue five, *News Style*, June 1998 & Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003.
- ²⁸ Shahidul Alum in Bangladesh and Endalkatchew Tesfa both had digital cameras but were not using them commercially yet.
- ²⁹ Also implied in *Dispatches from Disaster Zones: The Reporting of Humanitarian Emergencies, 1998, Viewing the World: A Study of British Television Coverage of Developing Countries, 2000 & Making Sense of the World, 2002.*
- ³⁰ Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003
- ³¹ Colin Jacobson, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ³² Vicky Goldberg, an interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ³³ The New Openings II survey (<http://www.picturesforchange.com>) conducted in December 2002 showed a number of NGO’s reporting occurrences of image branding
- ³⁴ Cheralyn Kirkwood, interview with the author, Lancaster, UK May 2003
- ³⁵ Rafiqur Rahman, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2003
- ³⁶ Jon Levy, telephone interview with the author, London, UK, June 2003
- ³⁷ Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003
- ³⁸ Linda Royles, Maganging director, British Association of Picture Libraries and Agencies, interview with the author, London, UK, June 2003
- ³⁹ Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003
- ⁴⁰ Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003
- ⁴¹ Chab Touré, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ⁴² Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003
- ⁴³ Michiel Munneke, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ⁴⁴ Rula Halawani, Reuters photographer 1991-2001, telephone interview with the author, Jerusalem, May 2003
- ⁴⁵ Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ⁴⁶ Antonio Fiorente, Endlakatchew Tesfa, Geta Mekonnen, Robel Mamo, interviews with the authors, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, June 2003.
- ⁴⁷ Maleos Tesfaye, Habtemarian Kenfemichel, Abera Dagne, Hapte Selase, Hailu Wendima, interviews with the authors, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, June 2003.
- ⁴⁸ Tamrat Giorgis, interview with the author, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, June 2003
- ⁴⁹ Rafiqur Rahman, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2003
- ⁵⁰ Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003
- ⁵¹ Vicky Goldberg, an interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ⁵² Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003

- ⁵³ Eamonn McCabe, Media Guardian, *Why we must show the dead*, November 19th, 2001
- ⁵⁴ Speaking at *So You Want to Change the World with Photography Conference*, Manchester, UK, February 2003
- ⁵⁵ Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ⁵⁶ Rafiqur Rahman, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2003
- ⁵⁷ Rafiqur Rahman, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2003
- ⁵⁸ Brett Rodgers introduction at the *Whose Image is it Anyway* discussion, The Barbican, London, UK, 22nd March 2003
- ⁵⁹ Speaking at *So You Want to Change the World with Photography Conference*, Manchester, UK, February 2003
- ⁶⁰ Paul Lowe, interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003.
- ⁶¹ Adrian Evans, Director of Panos Pictures, interview with the author, London, June 2003
- ⁶² The name is taken from a line in the film *Casablanca*, when a crime has been committed the lazy Police chief, tells his subordinates to “round up the usual suspects” rather than investigating the crime.
- ⁶³ Alun John, telephone interview with the author, May 2003
- ⁶⁴ Neo Nysoma, interview with the author, Dhaka, Bangladesh, April 2002
- ⁶⁵ From George Alagiah’s presentation at the Disasters from Disaster Zones conference, May 1998
- ⁶⁶ Vicky Goldberg, an interview with the author, Amsterdam, Holland, April 2003
- ⁶⁷ Brett Rodgers introduction at the *Whose Image is it Anyway* discussion, The Barbican, London, UK, 22nd March 2003
- ⁶⁸ Tafari Wossan, interview with the author, Awasa, Ethiopia, June 2003
- ⁶⁹ Outlined in section one.
- ⁷⁰ A direct transcript of an interview with Geldof on Saturday 31st May was printed in the Ethiopian reporter, June 4th 2003
- ⁷¹ Source <http://www.epa-photos.com>
- ⁷² published on the following day
- ⁷³ Antony Njuguna published in the Daily mirror and a cropped version in the Herald and Tribune, Arthur Edwards in the Sun and Antonio Fiorente’s print that was filed with AP.
- ⁷⁴ Both papers published on the 29th May
- ⁷⁵ Mahimbo Mode, UNICEF and John Graham, Save the Children
- ⁷⁶ The baby had been transferred for specialist treatment

Bibliography

Texts

Name	Title	Place	Publisher	Year
	<i>NUJ Guide to Freelancing</i>	London	NUJ	1996
	<i>Focus on Images</i>	London	Save the Children	
	Oxfam 50: Our World in Photographs	Oxfam		
	<i>The BAPLA Directory</i>	London	BAPLA	2002
	<i>CEPIC Directory</i>	London	Berlin	2002
Alam, S	<i>The Visual Representation of Developing Countries by Developmental Agencies and Western Media</i> http://zonezero.com:16080/magazine/index.en.html		Zone Zero	1994
Amanuel, Negash Wolde	<i>Revue Noire – African Contemporary Art</i>	Paris		March/ April/ May edition 1997

Amin, M, Willetts, D, Matherson, A	<i>Journey through Ethiopia</i>	Nairobi	Camerpix	1997
Beckwith, C & Fisher, A	<i>Africa Ark: Peoples of the Horn</i>	London	Collins & Harvill	1990
Benthall, Jonathan	<i>Disasters, Relief and the Media</i>	London	I.B. Tauris	1993
Campbell, D	Atrocity, Memory, Photography: Imaging the Concentration Camps of Bosnia – The Case of ITN versus Living Marxism, Part I		<i>Journal of Human Rights</i> 1:1, 1-33	2002
Campbell, D	Atrocity, Memory, Photography: Imaging the Concentration Camps of Bosnia – The Case of ITN versus Living Marxism, Part II		Journal of Human Rights 1:2	2002
Campbell, D	<i>Salgado and the Sahel: Documentary Photography and the Imaging Famine</i>			
Cane, Alan	Financial Times, <i>Ordered Images</i>	London		June 18 2002
Clark D	<i>New Openings II Survey</i> http://www.picturesforchange.org			accessed 03.2003
Clark, D	<i>New Openings Survey</i>	Lancaster	Folly Pictures	1994
Clark, D	<i>Real Picture</i>	Lancaster	Nextnorth	2000
DDZ	<i>Dispatches from Disaster Zones: The Reporting of Humanitarian Emergencies</i>	London		May 1998
DFID	<i>Viewing the World: A Study of British Television Coverage of Developing Countries</i>	London	DFID	2000
DFID	<i>Making Sense of the World</i>	London	DFID	2002
Fenton, Peter	<i>Taking a different perspective</i>	London	The Development Education Association	1995
Gaag, Nikki van der and Nash, Cathy	<i>Images of Africa: The UK Report</i>		Mimeo	1987
Geldof Bob	Geldof calls on the Geneva G-8 summit to focus on the African continent	Addis Ababa	The Ethiopian Reporter	4 June 2003
Golberg, Vicki	<i>the power of photography: How photographs changed our lives</i>	New York	Abbeville press	1991
Harrison, P & Palmer, R	<i>News out of Africa</i>	London	Shipman	1986
Holland, F (ed)	<i>The Full Picture (issue 82 Orbit)</i>	London	VSO	2002

Horton, B	<i>Guide to photojournalism</i>	New York	Associated Press	2001
Jacobson, Colin (ed)	<i>Underexposed</i>		Vision	2002
Jones, Graham	<i>The business of freelancing</i>		BFP Books	1987
Kenny, Sean	Lightbox, Issue five, <i>News Style</i>		BABLA	June 1998
Kenny, Sean	Lightbox, Issue twelve, <i>News Style</i>		BABLA	May 2000
Kunsthalle, Wien	<i>Flash Afrique !, photography from West Africa</i>		Steidl	2002
Lamunière, M	<i>You Look Beautiful Like That: The portrait photographs of Seydou and Malick Sidibé</i>	Yale	Yale University Press	2001
Lidchi, Henrietta	<i>All in the Choosing Eye: Charity, Representation and the Developing World</i>		Open University	1993
Lutz, Catherine and Collier, Jane,	<i>Reading National Geographic</i>	Chicago	The University of Chicago Press	1993
Magistad, Mary Kay	<i>The Ethiopian bandwagon :the relationship between news media coverage and British foreign policy toward the 1984-1985 Ethiopian famine</i>		Sussex theses ; M 471	1985
Manuelli, Sara	Design Week, <i>Altered Images</i>	London		17 April 2003
Martin, Amanda	<i>Race in the Frame</i>	London	BBC	1997
Martin, R. and Smith, G. (eds)	<i>Human geography: society, space and social science</i>	Basings toke	Macmillan	[GF41. H85]
McCabe, Eamon	Media Guardian, <i>Why we must show the dead</i>	London	The Guardian	19 November, 2001
Meachim, Sally	<i>Focus for Change</i>	London	<i>Focus for Change</i>	1992
Nomacho, Kazuyoshi	<i>Bless Ethiopia</i>	Hong Kong	Odyssey	1998
Pankhurst R & Gérard, D	<i>Ethiopia Photographed</i>	London	Kegan Paul	1996
Peak, Steve	<i>The Guardian media guide 2002</i>	London	The Guardian	2001
Robinson, Piers	<i>The CNN Effect, The myth of news, foreign policy and intervention</i>	London	Routledge	2002
Rubython, Tom	Eurobusiness, <i>Something out of Nothing (pp30-33)</i>	London		August 2002

Smith, Bob	<i>The man who moved the world : the life and work of Mohamed Amin</i>	Nairobi	Camerapix Publishers International	1998
Sontag, Susan	<i>On photography,</i>	Harmondsworth	Penguin	1979
Stalker, Peter (Ed)	<i>Can I Take Your Picture ?</i>	Oxford	New Internationalist	July 1988
Stott, William	<i>Documentary Expression and Thirties America</i>	Chicago	The University of Chicago Press	1986
Swain, Jon, Bleasdale Marcus	<i>One hundred years of darkness</i>		Pirogue Press	2002
Tracy, John	<i>The freelance photographer's market handbook</i>		BFP Books	2002
VSO	<i>VSO, The Live Aid Legacy: The Developing World Through British Eyes – A Research Report.</i>		VSO	2001
Wright, Terence	<i>The Photography Handbook</i>	London	Routledge	2000

Interviews

Name		Interview	Place	Date
Abdullah, Abir	Drik Staff Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	19 April 2003
Abraham, Bezunesh	Subject of Bob Geldof Picture	Interview with the author	Awasa, Ethiopia	24 June 2003
Alam, Shahidul	Director of Drik/Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	10 & 19 April
Aminuzzaman, Muhammad	Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	12 April 2003
Bartholomew, Pablo	Photographer	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	26 April 2003
Bermejo, Soraya	UNICEF Media Officer	Telephone Interview with the author	London	12 th June 2003
Biras, Andrew	Photography Student	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	21 April 2003

Bloemen, Shantha	UNICEF Communication officer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	20 June 2003
Dagne, Abera	Ethiopian Press Agency Photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	19 June 2003
Davidson, Bruce	Photographer	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	28 April 2003
Dimbleby, Jonathan	Broadcast Presenter	Interview with the author	London, UK	27 March 2003
Evans, Adrian	Director of Panos Pictures	Interview with the author	London	5 June 2003
Fiorente, Antonio	Photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	19 June 2003
Giorgis, Tamrat	Editor of the Fortune weekly newspaper	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	17 June 2003
Goldberg, Vicky	Academic	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	27 April 2003
Graham, John	Programme Director, Save the Children, UK, Ethiopia Office	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa	7 June 2003
Grigorian, Eric	Photographer (winner of World Press Photo 2003)	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	27 April 2003
Halawani, Rula	Photographer/Academic	Telephone Interview with the author	East Jerusalem	23 May 2003
Jacobson, Colin	Picture Editor/Writer	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	27 April 2003
John, Alun	Retired Picture Editor, The Independent	Telephone interview with the author	London, UK	23 May 2003
Johwa, Wilson	Zimbabwe Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	11 April 2003
Kenfemichel, Habtemarian	Ethiopian Press Agency Photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	19 June 2003
Kirkwood, Cheralyn	Designer, Great Vacation Company	Interview with the author	Lancaster, UK	29 May 2003

Kirsten, Claire	Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	23 April 2003
Koets, Maarten	Education, World Press Photo	Interview with the author	Bolton, UK	29 March 2003
Levy, Jon	Editor of Foto8	Telephone Interview with the author	London	12 June 2003
Lowe, Paul	Photographer	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	27 April 2003
Marium, Mesfin	Yirba Clinic Doctor	Interview with the author	Yirba, Ethiopia	24 June 2003
Mekonnen, Geta	Photographer/Artist	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	22 June 2003
Mode, Mahimbo	UNICEF emergency manager, Awasa	Interview with the author	Awasa, Ethiopia	24 June 2003
Momo, Robel	Associated press photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	19 July 2003
Munneke, Michiel	Managing Director, World Press Photo	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	27 April 2003
Muunni, Munira, Morshad	NGO Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	12 April 2003
Ntsoma, Neo	Photographer for <i>The Star</i> , South Africa	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	20 April 2003
Pankhurst, Richard	Ethiopian Historian	Telephone interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	27 June 2003
Rahim, Peu Azizur	News Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	21 April 2003
Rahman, Rafiqur	Reuters Cameraman/Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	20 April 2003
Royles, Linda	Managing Director, British Association of Picture Libraries and Agencies	Interview with the author	London, UK	5 June 2003
Ryan, John	Press Division Controller, Thompson Foundation	Interview with the author	Cardiff, UK	16 May 2003

Seyoum, Konjit	Director of Ansi Gallery	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	21 June
Shujauddin, Syed, Ahmed	Director General of National Institute of Mass Communication	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	21 April 2003
Sukkar, Yusuf, Abdullahi	Ethiopian Tourism Commissioner	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	20 June 2003
Tafesse, Hapte-Selassie	Retired Ethiopian Tourism Commissioner	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	19 June 2003
Tesfa, Endalkatchew	Photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	18 June 2003
Tesfaye, Maleos	Photographer	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	18 June 2003
Touré, Chab	Director of La Galerie Chab, Bamako, Mali	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	26 April 2003
Uddin, Main	Drik Staff Photographer	Interview with the author	Dhaka, Bangladesh	18 April 2003
Van Der Houwen, Pieter	Photographer	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	26 April 2003
Wei, Denge	Executive Director of China press Institute	Interview with the author	Amsterdam, Holland	28 April 2003
Wendima, Hailu	Photographer with the Fortune weekly newspaper	Interview with the author	Addis Ababa, Ethiopia	17 June 2003
Wossan, Tafari	Media Consultant	Interview with the author	Awasa, Ethiopia	25 June 2003

World Wide Web

Name	Title	Publisher	Accessed
	<i>Agence French Presse</i> http://afp.com	Agence French Presse	accessed 03.2003
	<i>Associated Press</i> http://www.ap.org	Associated Press	accessed 11.02
	Associated Press Photographs http://www.ap.org/pages/history/photos.htm	Associated Press	accessed 11.02

	<i>Corbis</i> http://www.corbis.com	Corbis	accessed 11.02
	European Pressphoto Agency http://www.epa-photos.com	EPA	accessed 11.02
	Getty Images http://www.gettyimages.com	Getty Images	accessed 11.02
Clark D	<i>New Openings II Survey</i> http://www.picturesforchange.org		accessed 03.2003
	Reuters http://www.reuters.com	Reuters	accessed 11.02
Alam, S	<i>The Visual Representation of Developing Countries by Developmental Agencies and Western Media</i> http://zonezero.com:16080/magazine/indexen.html	Zone Zero	accessed 03.2003
	<i>Us Equity Research</i> http://jpmorgan.com	JP Morgan	accessed 05.03